

they were searching for potential evidence and a British florist offered a discount on “apology flowers.”

Avid Life’s decision to face down the hackers raises tough moral and legal questions.

The demand was even more dramatic than that faced by Sony Pictures Entertainment late last year. Then, hackers believed to be affiliated with North Korea wanted the studio to cancel the release of a movie. Avid Life faced a request to close its best-known business, which claimed 38 million users.

Federal investigators often warn hacking victims not to comply with hackers’ demands —fearing that will only embolden future attackers.

One problem of dealing with hackers is “you’re putting your trust in someone who is inherently untrustworthy,” said Andre McGregor, a former special agent with the Federal Bureau of Investigation and now the director of security at Tanium Inc., a San Francisco Bay Area cybersecurity company.

Lisa Sotto, a partner at Hunton & Williams LLP who specializes in data breaches, said Avid Life was put in an impossible position by the demand it shut down. But Ms. Sotto said the company could have done more in the past month to reach out to users who may have been affected. For instance, she said she noticed that AshleyMadison.com’s home page on Wednesday still made no mention of the breach. Rather, users have to scroll through recent news releases in the press section of the site.

NBC News reported that Avid spokesman Paul Keable said at least some of the data posted online this week is legitimate. Mr. Keable and his associates didn’t respond to phone calls and emails from The Wall Street Journal. An outside spokeswoman for Avid, Jennifer Tong, said only, “I don’t have anything additional.”

The hackers, or hacker, apparently dumped troves of company files onto the “dark Web,” areas of the Internet not accessible by consumer browsers. The data included credit-card transactions and account details but not credit-card numbers, according to security researchers. In a statement on the Ashley Madison website, Avid said, “No current or past members’ full credit card numbers were stolen.”

It can be difficult to verify the true identities of Ashley Madison users. The company apparently didn’t verify the email addresses that users supplied.

The website hosting the newly disclosed files can only be accessed through the Tor

“We have explained the fraud, deceit, and stupidity of ALM and their members,” the post reads. “Now everyone gets to see their data.”

On Wednesday evening, a spokesman for Avid Life referred questions about the breach to Cycura, a Toronto cybersecurity firm Avid Life hired to investigate the breach.

The Federal Bureau of Investigation and Royal Canadian Mounted Police are involved in the investigation, said a spokesman for Cycura.

—*Orr Hirschauge contributed to this article.*

Write to Danny Yadron at danny.yadron@wsj.com

Copyright 2014 Dow Jones & Company, Inc. All Rights Reserved

This copy is for your personal, non-commercial use only. Distribution and use of this material are governed by our Subscriber Agreement and by copyright law. For non-personal use or to order multiple copies, please contact Dow Jones Reprints at 1-800-843-0008 or visit www.djreprints.com.